# Citation, Intertextuality and Memory in the Middle Ages: Text, Music, Image

29–30 January 2009

University of Exeter, Streatham Campus, Reed Hall

## Abstracts

Benjamin Albritton (University of Washington - Corpus Christi College Cambridge)

**Translation and parody: responses to Machaut's Lay de confort**

In 1360, the Treaty of Bretigny was signed between Edward the III of England and Jean II of France, allowing the French king the freedom to return to his lands as sovereign for the first time since his disastrous capture in 1356 at the Battle of Poitiers. Among the many concessions necessary for fulfillment of the treaty, the passing into captivity of a broad swath of the French nobility provoked the strongest literary response from the greatest poet of the period, Guillaume de Machaut. Le Dit de la Fonteinne Amoureuse immortalises the departure of Jean, Duc de Berry into captivity in a fictional account. Though less well known, the complex musical and poetic tour-de-force of Machaut’s Lay de Confort treats a similar theme, this time as a song of comfort for the captive prince. A rare example of a fully polyphonic lay, Machaut’s melodic and poetic invention sparked responses from two poets active at the English court during the period of French captivity: Geoffrey Chaucer and Jean Froissart. These responses differ dramatically, from Chaucer’s translation of memorable passages from the lay in his Book of the Duchess to Froissart’s adoption of Machaut’s form, and complete rewriting of content, in his lay S’onques amoureusement. These two very different re-uses of Machaut’s work illuminate the way a network of citational references could develop and operate in a closely defined artistic circle: poets and audiences associated with the English and French courts of the 1360s.

Jenny Benham (Institute for Historical Research, London)

**Constructing memories of peacemaking**

Among the anecdotes that the late twelfth-century writer Walter Map retells in his A Courtier’s Trifles is a story about an Anglo-Welsh peace conference. According to Map, the Welsh ruler Llywelyn had shown himself so oppressive and dangerous to his neighbours that King Edward (the Confessor) decided to intervene on behalf of his people. Ambassadors were sent back and forth across the river Severn in small boats between Edward’s camp at Aust Cliff and Llywelyn’s camp at Beachley. After an exchange of several messages, there was an argument to decide which one of the two rulers should cross over to the other. Walter Map states that Llywelyn claimed precedence, but that Edward claimed equality. One might think that Walter with this story in some way reflected the situation in his own days rather than that of the mid-eleventh century; after all such narrative tools were often used by medieval writers. Indeed had his story reflected contemporary negotiations, Walter’s statement that the English king only claimed equality with the Welsh prince would have been quite significant, as it is evident that the English king usually claimed precedence at Anglo-Welsh conferences. However, Walter Map’s account of this meeting is almost word for word based on the Burgundian writer Raoul Glaber’s description of the 1023 meeting between the Emperor Henry II and King Robert the Pious of France. It is probable that Map, rather than using Glaber’s story, got it from a common source. The modern editors of these two works have not indicated a link between the texts, nor any common source, and no historian has to date flagged up the similarities between the stories. The latter is particularly regrettable, because historians have used these accounts as a guide for understanding peacemaking. However, the issue of writers borrowing from other texts to reconstruct memories of how rulers made peace is a recurring one. This paper will discuss the purpose behind the construction of such memories and ask to what extent modern historians should, or could, separate between fact and fiction.

Jacques Boogaart (Amsterdam University)

**Citation and transformation in Machaut’s musical works: the follies of the sighing lover in Motet 2**

Guillaume de Machaut’s many quotations from, and allusions to, texts from the recent and distant past allow for a particularly interesting view into his thoughts about the relationship between text and music, especially since he often illustrated the literary image by some musical device. The most revealing aspect is found in Machaut’s meaningful manipulation of the original texts, which sometimes even subverts their first signification, a process by which we get an inkling of how he interpreted his borrowings. By transforming and elaborating Machaut not just continued but often also problematized the amorous topoi of his predecessors. One fascinating example, in his motet Tout corps / De souspirant cuer / Suspiro, suggests that the bizarreness of the music finds its reason, perhaps even its origin, in the quoted text, which deals with the idea of folly and transgression. In this case, like in some other works, the transformation concerns less the quoted text itself than, rather, the gender of the speaking person, calling forth the question what significance such a gender exchange may have had for Machaut.

Emma Cayley (University of Exeter)

**Citation as Transvestism in Fifteenth Century French Poetry**

The female poet-interlocutors of the anonymous fifteenth-century debate (c. 1457), the Debat de la Noire et de la Tannee (Debate of the Black and Brown Dressed Ladies) are observed from outside the room in which they are sitting by the male narrator who remains concealed throughout behind a trellis. The ladies are identified and distinguished from one another by means of their clothing: black and brown dress respectively. The violet-coloured linings of their dresses; their belts; stockings; the way their clothes cling to their breasts, are lovingly, indeed rather lasciviously, described at length. The hidden narrator takes his time to record his lingering visual impressions of the ladies, and when he finally begins to listen to their poetic laments, over a fifth of his poem has already elapsed. In the Debat de la Damoiselle et de la Bourgeoise (Debate of the Young Lady and the Woman, c. 1460), the narrator is transported in a dream before a court of Love where he observes a 'Damoiselle' and a 'Bourgoise' debating the merits of the headdress each wears: the 'atour' (hennin) and the 'chapperon' (bonnet), to which their respective social ranks entitle them. Implicitly, and later explicitly, the ladies argue about sexual predilection, experience, and mores.

 As Gaunt observes, via Burns and Schultz, clothes are the outward social markers of gender. In both these debates, and other fifteenth-century French poetry, male narrators take pleasure in 'dressing' as women, in the dual sense that they both narrate women's clothing, and narrate women. In this paper I investigate how male narrators' 'putting on' of women's voices, or 'citation' of women parallels the 'putting on' of women's clothes, for the space of the debate, in the light of Crane's notions of enactment, performance and self, and Butler's notion of 'citationality', or gender as performance.

Helen Deeming (University of Southampton)

**Music, memory and mobility: citation and contrafactum in thirteenth-century sequence repertories**

In the circulation of new sequence repertories from the late twelfth century onwards, particularly those emanating from the Augustinian house of St Victor in Paris, certain melodies attained a kind of canonic status. As ideal embodiments of typical patterns of line-length, poetic structure and musical modality, such melodies were re-used in many different ways by musicians and poets of the thirteenth century. Focusing on some recently re-discovered sequences from thirteenth-century England (contrafacta of such medieval ‘hits’ as Laudes crucis attollamus and Letabundus exultet fidelis chorus), this paper explores the fluidity with which sequence melodies were re-configured by later musicians, assessing the joint roles of oral memory and written texts as agents of these adaptations, and contributing to an understanding of why the source-melodies achieved such an authoritative status in medieval musical culture

Sonja Drimmer (Columbia University)

**Allusive images: intervisuality in late Middle English manuscripts?**

In this paper, I argue that fifteenth-century manuscripts of Middle English texts invoke specific visual sources – and depend on reader/viewer’s visual memory – in order to codify variation as the condition of vernacular creative agency. In part one, I address the changing pictorial representation of the author from the divinely-inspired St. Matthew archetype to the author whose creative agency is expressed as a reconfiguration of prior works. Iconographical and formal analysis of such author “portraits” reveals a shifting attitude toward the phenomena of invention. These images are of interest not because they reflect late medieval authorial practice, but rather because they indicate illuminators' decision to depict invention as an intertextual performance. This initial section foregrounds the second part of my talk, which analyzes late medieval allusive images in manuscripts containing works by John Gower and John Lydgate. It is commonly recognized that each manuscriptual witness of a text does not present the original work, but instead re-presents or performs it. Through several examples, I explore how manuscript producers deployed pictorial allusion and variation to guide reader/viewers into intervisual modes of generating meaning that parallel the poetic activities of late Middle English authors.

Naomi Howell (University of Exeter)

**Sensory sepulchres: citations of Christ's tomb in twelfth-century romance**

Christ’s tomb, the object at the heart of the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, might be an object of deep veneration and sublime contemplation but not, one would think, of curiosity. A simple stone bench, its regular planes conceal no mystery and offer no ornament to arouse the senses. By the early twelfth century, however, the plain bench had been covered over with an outer casing of marble encrusted with jewels and gold. The casing was designed both to conceal and reveal the sacred object within: through three round holes in the casing, pilgrims were able to view, touch and even kiss the bench on which Christ’s body had once rested. By means of this innovation, the encounter with the Christ’s sepulchre became invested with new elements of curiosity and sensory experience. As Stephen Lamia has shown, the rituals enacted around the sepulchre were designed to appeal to all five senses, thus ensuring that the experience was deeply imprinted on the pilgrim’s memory.

 From the middle of the twelfth century, images of the encased sepulchre with its distinctive three holes begin to appear in western European art. As I shall argue in this paper, reflections of the sepulchre can also be found in French romances of the later twelfth-century, specifically Le Chevalier de Charrette, Cligés, and Floire et Blancheflor. These romances all feature tombs which, though secular, can be read as citations of Christ’s sepulchre both for their sensory richness and for the mysteries which they conceal. Notably, like Christ’s tomb, all three tombs of romance are ultimately revealed to be empty. In Charrette, Lancelot alone can lift the lid of the magnificent tomb which contains no body but only a name – his own. In Cligés, the tomb described as beautiful and fit for a saint in fact contains the living body of Fenice, who will leave it empty when rescued by her lover. Whilst drawing attention to these cases, this paper will focus on the tomb in Floire et Blancheflor, which is described at remarkable length. This tomb is empty from the start, having been created to fool Floire into believing his beloved is dead. Cunningly designed to appeal to each of the five senses, and in its decoration incorporating all of creation, the tomb seeks both to awaken longing and to satisfy the desires it evokes. If the tomb of Blancheflor represents an idolatrous anti-image of the sepulchre of Christ, it is perhaps also a critique of the way in which, in the twelfth century, the most holy site in Christendom was offering visitors an increasingly sensual satisfaction.

Sarah Kay (Princeton University)

**What is a quotation in the Leys d’amors?**

All the Occitan manuals of grammar, rhetoric and poetics (apart from the Donatz proensals of Uc Faidit) incorporate quotations from the troubadours within a framework broadly inherited from the Latin school handbooks of Donatus and Priscien. The earlier of the two versions of Leys d’amors (1341?) written by Guilhem Molinier for the Consistori del gay saber at Toulouse remains attached to this tradition, containing a scattering of quotations from well-known troubadours antics among the many verse examples confected by Molinier himself. The second prose redaction (1356) is, however, differently conceived. It suppresses the treatment of rhetorical figures from the first redaction and substitutes a new opening book based on the writings of Albertano of Brescia and Brunetto Latini. Rhetoric is no longer seen as a catalogue of devices but viewed, within an overall encyclopaedic framework, as a civic tool, a mechanism of government, and ultimately a means of judgement. In this second redaction the excerpts from troubadour songs are almost all dispensed with, except for liberal doses of the works of Guilhem’s chief luminary, At de Mons. By contrast, the texts of Albertano and Brunetto are reproduced wholesale, being variously quoted, cited, or silently copied; many of their quotations – Albertano in particular is a great compiler of classical auctoritates – become part of Molinier’s text. In thus quoting (?) his sources, Molinier not only translates them into Occitan, but sometimes also recasts them in verse; some of these verse adaptations are then assigned to a figure Molinier refers to ‘l’Actor’, in a way that seems to redefine their status as ‘quotations’. This paper will focus on the status of quotation in the second redaction. Drawing especially on Derrida’s writings on iterability (see especially ‘Signature événement contexte’) it will inquire into the relationship between quoting, compiling, borrowing, and translating, and examine what kinds of ‘mark’ or ‘remark’ come to signal quotation now that the days of the troubadours antics are finally over.

Marguerite Keane (Drew University at Madison)

**Memory and royal identity in the chapel of Blanche of Navarre at Saint-Denis**

In 1371 Blanche of Navarre, dowager queen of France, founded a chapel at Saint-Denis, the abbey church near Paris. The chapel housed the tomb of her recently deceased daughter, Jeanne, and would eventually serve as the resting place for Blanche herself, who would live another twenty-seven years. For the chapel she commissioned a marble tomb of kinship, with twenty-four statues of her esteemed ancestors and important living relatives, as well as column-statues, paintings, and other liturgical objects.

 The death of Blanche’s daughter motivated the founding of the chapel, but I argue that its emphasis on the queen’s status and her esteemed family history was prompted by two other events of 1371: the death of Jeanne of Évreux, the elder dowager queen at the French court, and a peace treaty between Charles of Navarre, Blanche’s brother, and the French king Charles V that ended decades of animosity between the two. In her chapel Blanche employed citation and memory to present a prestigious image of herself. The statues of Blanche’s illustrious ancestors reminded the viewer of her lineage, and emphasized those family members who were sufficiently revered and distant enough to veil the recent political troubles of her family. I argue that Blanche copied elements from the chapel of Jeanne of Évreux, just across the transept at Saint-Denis, to bolster her own status in the absence of the deceased queen. The genealogical identity represented in Blanche’s chapel also makes reference to the program of the tombs of the French kings only steps from the chapel in the crossing at Saint-Denis; the royal tombs were arranged according to each king’s descent from Saint Louis, and this principle also dictated the organization of Blanche’s chapel. Blanche created a microcosm of the genealogy of the French court to present herself at its center, a queen crucial to both a glorious French past and its present.

Sjoerd Levelt (Warburg Institute, London)

**Citation and misappropriation in Geoffrey of Monmouth's Historia regum Britannie and the Latin Galfridian tradition**

Geoffrey of Monmouth's Historia regum Britannie, one of the most popular historical texts of the late Middle Ages, owed its unprecedented impact partly to the creative use its author made of his sources. Extensive citations from the Venerable Bede's Historia ecclesiastica gentis Anglorum situate it in a particular historical tradition. But its author also relied on his readers' textual knowledge of Bede to create a new historiography which was, as I shall argue, intentionally subversive to that tradition, by means of misquotation, citation of passages out of context, and other forms of textual manipulation.

 The same combination of citation and misappropriation became a key strategy of writers who based their works on Geoffrey of Monmouth's Historia, both adherents and critics. From its initial 'discovery' by Henry of Huntingdon soon after its creation, throughout the English historical tradition, including the works of Gerald of Wales, to much later uses by humanists including Erasmus, authors relied on the textual memories of their readers to challenge, amend or confirm the historical model presented in the Historia regum Britannie through citation and misappropriation.

 The recognition of the prevalence of such strategies in historical texts throughout the later Middle Ages into the Early Modern period challenges the ‒to this day‒ surprisingly persistent notion that the activity of the medieval historian consisted of little more than mindlessly transmitting the materials of his sources. Thus, the aim of my paper will be to argue for the merits of an intertextual reading of medieval historiographical texts.

Anthony Musson (University of Exeter)

**The power of image: allusion and intertextuality in medieval English law books**

Pictures, we are frequently reminded, speak a thousand words. Images in medieval illuminated manuscripts similarly offered a broad palette and could convey multiple messages. Medieval law books in particular seem to have provided a setting for the illustration of complex notions, partly as a memory stimulus for practitioners, but partly also for straightforward entertainment or as means of furthering intellectual dabate. Much may have depended upon the instructions of the commissioning patron or the knowledge and experience of the scribe/artis, though this is an area about which often little is known. Some of the legal images included in the surviving volumes can be regarded as 'citations' in that they refer pictorally to existing models or examplars or to known genres (whether biblical, literary or legal) employing similar images. The images also betray allusion to motifs and ideas that fall outside the normal legal sphere, but which nevertheless can underline a point being made in the legal text. As such, therefore, they form an under-researched and under-represented area of historical concern.

R. Barton Palmer (Clemson University)

**The rhetoric of allusion in Machaut's Fonteinne amoureuse**

Allusions, as intertextual theory has it, juxtapose (or, perhaps better, incorporate) two texts, the base (that which alludes) and the reference (that which is alluded to). Allusions are thus present in some reduced form in the base, which they also transform into a textual order whose meaning can only be arrived at transtextually, dialogically. Looked at from the viewpoint of reception, allusions, however, are not only incorporations that overcome the necessary limits of textual boundaries. They are also, potentially at least, instructions for reading. One aspect of this rhetoric is that the allusion might indicate those features of the reference are to be activated by the reader. From this perspective, the allusions in Machaut's Fonteinne Amoureuse to Classical story in the Ovide moralisé can be understood not only as "borrowings of material" that are activated in a new textual context, but as an engagement with the characteristic structure of the Ovide moralisé itself, that is, its division into story and moralizing interpretation. Such moralizing, as I show, can be found in the commentary on the stories of Ceys and the Judgment of Paris produced by the poem's narrator and the sorrowing nobleman whose companion in meaning making he becomes. The point of this rhetoric is to underline the difference between Machaut's text and the Ovide moralisé, in which a secularizing hermeneutic is substituted for a moralizing one.

Eyal Poleg (University of Edinburgh)

**Biblical fabric or quasi-biblical language: modes of citation in preaching and liturgy**

Biblical citation in literary, visual and performative forms, were ubiquitous in medieval Europe. Two mediums in particular, preaching and liturgy, seem to have drawn from the depth of the Bible in establishing their authority. An examination of Palm Sunday liturgy and Advent Sunday sermons (both sharing the same pericope – Mt. 21:1-9) of late medieval England, reveals two very distinct modes of citation.

 The Bible constituted the core of sermons; at times dozens of biblical citations were incorporated into its text to the extent that sermons were deemed a fabric woven (texitur) from biblical materials. Similarly, the liturgy of the medieval church celebrated biblical events and texts; the Psalms were the most recurring liturgical text, chanted in in their entirety throughout Christendom. The centrality of the Bible did not lead to similar techniques of citation. Sermons presented biblical quotations in a discrete form, accompanied by citation formulae and biblical reference (particularly after the introduction of the modern chapter division in the thirteenth century). Liturgy, on the other hand, did not signal out biblical quotations or allusions. Melodies, gestures, actors and paraphernalia differentiated between parts of the ritual but not between biblical and extra-biblical elements. A close analysis of antiphons and versicles even reveals an attempt to merge biblical and extra-biblical elements into a single creation. Thus, while preachers relied on (mostly biblical) proofs to validate each and every argument, liturgical rites emulated biblical language to the extent that the entire liturgical corpus became ‘quasi-biblical’, conferring the authority of the Bible on its liturgical reenactment. These differences influenced the reception of the bible in a society in which direct access to the Bible was the exception rather than the rule.

Jennifer Saltzstein (University of Oklahoma)

**Refrain citation and vernacular authority in the music of Adam de la Halle**

The thirteenth-century French city of Arras was a fertile region for song production, where active patronage and the confrèrie des jongleurs et des bourgeois elevated the social status of trouvères and fostered a competitive artistic community. Musical procedures such as contrafacta, modeling, and musical citation encouraged poets to respond directly to their contemporaries by borrowing and transforming their musical structures. Adam de la Halle was the most celebrated trouvère of the region, and arguably the most self-conscious about his authorial status. Many of his works appear autobiographical, featuring a character named Adam who is best described as a clerk and reluctant trouvère. In the Jeu de la feuillée and the motet Aucun se sont loé/A dieu/Super te, for example, the corrupted city of Arras figures as an impediment to Adam’s return to Paris, where he hopes to resume his university studies.

 This paper explores the relationship between Adam’s use of citation and the clerkly side of his authorial persona. In particular, I focus on his citation of refrains, the pithy, music-textual phrases that populate thirteenth-century music and poetry. Adam is one of very few trouvères to cite his own refrains, three of which form an intricate intertextual network across his rondeaux, motets, and plays. A listener armed with the memory of each of these contexts is invited to interpret Adam’s works cross-textually, a process that frequently leads to questions of his authorial persona. Through refrains such as “A dieu commant amouretes,” Adam articulates his desire to leave Arras and return to Paris, pointing away from his life as a trouvère and toward the university. Adam also displays his adopted clerical identity through the compositional manipulation of these cited refrains, which he subjects to quasi-exegetical gloss and commentary. Recent research by Alastair Minnis and historian Carolyn Symes encourages an interpretation of these works as part of the rise of vernacular authority in thirteenth-century French culture; through auto-citation, Adam positions himself, it seems, as a vernacular auctor.

Wim Verbaal (Ghent University)

**Towards a hermeneutics of remembrance: intertextual poetics in twelfth-century literature**

Intertextuality is mostly approached in its most basic aspects, as a way of linking a text to its architexte or model, thus trying to find a clue to the reference frame of its writer. Less studied, however, have been the technical poetics of intertextual mechanisms. How is the texture of intertextual references for a given texte constructed? What has guided the writer in his choices of references? What did he avoid? If he wants the reader to recognize several texts, how does he combine his reference so that they interfere in such a way that the reader is not confused? The twelfth century offers a gold mine for anyone interested in the differing ways intertextuality can work. I propose to elaborate in my paper these active technics of intertextual writing and to illustrate its working in some texts, as the Historia calamitatum of Peter Abelard and the De consideratione of Bernard of Clairvaux.

Eliza Zingesser (Princeton University)

**Genealogies of song: vernacularity in Dante's De vulgari eloquentia, and Nicole de Margival's Dit de la panthere**

In this paper, I argue that Dante’s De vulgari eloquentia may have served as a model for Nicole de Margival’s Dit de la panthere. Both authors employ the panther metaphorically – Dante to symbolize the illustrious vernacular and Nicole to symbolize his beloved. I suggest that these two texts have recourse to similar strategies of vernacular authorization: both describe a vernacular tradition that culminates in the poetic prowess of their own authors. I offer a reading of Nicole’s Dit as a summa of vernacular writing – one that is achieved through strategically placed citations and allusions to other texts, including the Roman de la rose, Drouars La Vache’s translation of Andreas Capellanus’s De amore and a lapidary by Jean L’Épicier. The Dit is also interpolated with excerpts from Adam de la Halle’s repertory of grands chants courtois along with some unidentified lyrics, some of which are diegetically attributed to the protagonist. While the density of non-authorial material in the Panthere has been read exclusively as a reflection of Nicole’s timidity or unoriginality, I suggest that it is, on the contrary, part of a strategy of self-promotion. Nicole treats the authors he cites as veritable auctores, thereby positioning himself within an illustrious tradition. I argue that the Dit also includes a subtle anthology of some hundred years of lyric composition by drawing attention to Nicole’s reworking of poetic forms such as the salut d’amor and the alba, the chanson de geste and the congé. I further suggest that Nicole’s use of Adam de la Halle’s lyrics is not as a deferent as it appears; Nicole cites only Adam’s grand chants courtois, saving his own forward-looking rondeaux, virelais and ballades for an epilogue. Through this structural strategy, Nicole suggests that he is the culmination of the lyric genealogy he has traced.